

ARIZONA BOARD OF APPRAISAL
1400 West Washington, Suite 360
Phoenix, Arizona 85007
(602)542-1539 FAX (602)542-1598
Web Site: www.appraisal.state.az.us

MINUTES
REGULAR BOARD MEETING
THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 19, 2009, 9:00 AM.

Board Members Present at Roll Call in Person: Les Abrams; Gabe Corral; Victor Hartsfield; Myra Jefferson; Michael Marquess; Debbie Rudd. A quorum was present. Board Members Present after Roll Call: Cynthia Henry. Vacant Board Member Positions: Certified General Appraiser; Public.

Also Present at Roll Call: Debb Pearson, Executive Director; Rebecca Loar, Regulatory Compliance Administrator; Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General.

Les Abrams acted as Chairperson.

The Board pledged allegiance to the flag of the United States of America.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Michael Marquess moved that the Minutes of the January 13, 2009, Telephonic Special Board Meeting be approved. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted 5-0 in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral abstained. Myra Jefferson moved that the Minutes of the January 15, 2009, Regular Board Meeting be approved. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Review and Action Concerning 2418, Lance R. Freeman.

Respondent appeared and was represented by Michael T. Denious, Esq. Michael Marquess moved that the Board approve David A. Lewin, Certified General Appraiser # 30380, to act as Respondent's mentor under the 1/15/09 Consent Agreement and Order for 30 Day Suspension (Stayed). Victor Hartsfield seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Michael Marquess moved that the Board amend the 1/15/09 Consent Agreement and Order for 30 Day Suspension (Stayed) to allow the mentor to prepare Standard 3 Reviews upon proof to the Board that the client will not accept a co-signature, said amendment to be effective retroactively to 1/15/09. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted 5-1 in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral voted no. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Respondent in compliance with the 1/15/09 Consent Agreement and Order for 30 Day Suspension (Stayed). Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted 5-1 in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral voted no.

Cynthia Henry joined the meeting.

Review and Action Concerning 2307, Razvan P. Silvas.

Respondent and his mentor appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board terminate the mentorship and probation. Victor Hartsfield seconded the motion. The Board voted 2-5 against the motion upon the following roll call vote: Les Abrams—no; Gabe Corral—no; Victor Hartsfield—yes; Cynthia Henry—no; Myra Jefferson—no; Michael Marquess—no;

Debbie Rudd—yes. Michael Marquess moved that the Board terminate the mentorship and continue the probation for 90 days. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

NEW BUSINESS

Discussion and Action Concerning Board Audit of Requested Appraisals Performed by Razvan P. Silvas.

Razvan P. Silvas appeared. Michael Marquess moved that appraisals #2 and #3 be referred to investigation (without complaints being opened). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted 5-2 in favor of the motion. Les Abrams and Myra Jefferson voted no.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Review and Action Concerning 2421, Michelle T. Caraballo.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board grant Respondent an extension until 3/31/09 to complete her disciplinary education. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2768, Wade A. LaVigne.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2434, Thomas M. Kittelmann.

Respondent appeared. Michael Marquess moved that the Board grant Respondent a four-month extension to complete his disciplinary education. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2439/2520/2523 William A. Buehl.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report concerning 2439. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative reports concerning 2520 and 2530, with the correction of typographical errors. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Michael Marques seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. The Board noted the 12-month file review.

Review and Action Concerning 2648, Julie D. Friess.

Respondent appeared. Michael Marquess recused himself. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Victor Hartsfield seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing the violations and requiring remedial education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted 5-1 in favor of the motion. Cynthia Henry voted no.

Review and Action Concerning 2653, Franklin R. Lloyd.

Michael Marquess recused himself. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that, based on the expiration of Respondent's 90-day grace period to renew, the complaint be closed to be reopened and considered in the event Respondent reapplies. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2727, King G. Ruby.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Victor Hartsfield seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

The Assistant Attorney General was requested to prepare guidance for the Board concerning the opening and nonopening of complaints to comply with Board statutes and rules.

Review and Action Concerning 2721, Joseph A. Turley/2722 Douglas C. Underwood.

Respondents appeared. Michael Marquess moved that the Board accept the investigative reports. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Michael Marquess moved that the Board invite Respondents to an informal hearing. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2378, Michael Santana.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board terminate the probation under the 12/19/07 Consent Agreement and Order noting that the mentorship had previously been terminated. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2770, Dennis F. McNeil.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2725, Thomas A. Canale.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing the violations and providing for remedial education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2595, Bruce R. Berkson.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing the violations and providing for remedial education. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2481, Daniel W. Mahoney.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. The Board noted the 12-month file review.

Review and Action Concerning 2488, Richard A. Webb.

Respondent did not appear. Jeanne Galvin advised the Board that Respondent's License # 11257 had been revoked as part of the sentencing order issued by the Maricopa County Superior Court. Staff was instructed to close the complaint.

Review and Action Concerning 2503, Randall P. Jacobs.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that the Board open complaint 2803 against Respondent and schedule a formal hearing before the Board. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level IV violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order citing the violations and providing for suspension, probation, mentorship and disciplinary education. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. The Board noted the 12-month file review.

PUBLIC ANNOUNCEMENTS AND CALL TO PUBLIC

Julie Friess, Certified Residential Appraiser # 20957, filed a Call to Public and spoke to the Board concerning the Board's investigators, summary suspensions and formal hearings.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Review and Action Concerning 2577, Dennis E. Poole.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing the violations and providing for remedial education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2715, William M. Nold.

Respondent did not appear. Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2734, Cody J. Turton.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing the violations and requiring remedial education. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted 6-1 in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral voted no.

Review and Action Concerning 2214, Lawrence E. Bloom.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board terminate the mentorship and probation under the 2/4/07 Consent Agreement and Order. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2462/2463/2464/2465/2466/2467/2468/2469, Shawkat E. Halabu.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that the Board approve David A. Lewin, Certified General Appraiser #30380, as Respondent's mentor under the 12/16/08 Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Order of Probation. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2486, Kisten L. Stormo.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board approve Ann L. Susko, Certified Residential Appraiser #20002 as Respondent's mentor, under the 8/25/08 Consent Agreement and Order. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2495, David C. Hartman.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that the Board grant Respondent a 30-day extension to provide proof of his remedial education under the 7/14/08 nondisciplinary letter of remedial action. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2511, Marc L. Arnowitz.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that, based on the expiration of Respondent's 90-day grace period to renew, the complaint be closed to be reopened and considered in the event Respondent reapplies. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2623, Larry W. Capps.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board open complaint 2804 for noncompliance with the 7/14/08 nondisciplinary letter of remedial action. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Regarding Issues Dealing With Formal Hearing Concerning 2321/2501/2573, Thomas J. Dozier.

Respondent did not appear. Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Debbie Rudd moved that, based on the expiration of Respondent's 90-day grace period to renew, the Board close the complaints, to be reopened and considered in the event Respondent reappears; and that the Board rescind its referrals for formal hearing to the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. The Board noted that 2321/2501 were under 12-month file review.

Review and Action Regarding Issues Dealing With Formal Hearing Concerning 2444 (08F-2444-BOA), Dawna G. Khourdepaz.

Respondent did not appear. Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Michael Marquess moved that, based on the 1/29/09 Consent Agreement and Order, the Board rescind its referral for formal hearing to the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Regarding Issues Dealing With Formal Hearing Concerning 2497, Michael D. Schendel.

Respondent did not appear. Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board rescind its referral for formal hearing to the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH) and that the formal hearing be scheduled before the Board at its April meeting. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning Superior Court Case CV-06-4140 (03F-1782-BOA/03F-1784-BOA)/2492, Felicia M. Coplan.

Respondent did not appear. Jeanne Galvin updated the Board concerning the court proceedings concerning CV-06-4140 (03F-1782-BOA/03F-1784-BOA). The Board noted the 12-month file review concerning 2492.

NEW BUSINESS

Discussion and Action Concerning Board Audit of Requested Appraisal Performed by Andrew E. Ament.

Michael Marquess moved that the appraisal be referred to investigation (without a complaint being opened). Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Review and Action Concerning 2592, Michael W. Marquess.

Respondent appeared. Michael Marquess recused himself. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern citing the violations. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2740/2748, Anthony C. Pierson.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summaries were read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level V violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Voluntary Surrender citing the violations and providing for surrender of Respondent's certified residential certificate # 21521; and in the event Respondent does not agree, that the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2487/2763, Nathan G. Morris.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board continue its scheduled hearing concerning 2487 and consolidate 2487 and 2763 for formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. The Board noted its 12-month file review concerning 2487.

Review and Action Concerning 2766, Lance R. Freeman.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2769, Jeremy M. Reising.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2771, James J. Graham.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a due diligence consent letter citing the violations and providing for disciplinary education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2773, Frederick J. Seidel.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2775, William C. Harding.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2453, Jaime Topete.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board noted that the Administrative Law Judge was to issue her decision following the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2477, Robert L. VanDyke.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board noted the pending formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2502, Clare A. Williamson-Redding.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board noted the pending formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2516, Timothy R. Fortunato.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board noted that the matter was pending settlement.

BOARD CHAIRMAN REPORT

None.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT

Debb Pearson reported on the status of the Assistant Attorney General's assignments; advised the complaint answer dates that had been extended by staff; and reported the following complaint statistics as of 1/31/09 for calendar years 2007, 2008, and 2009:

	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2009</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2009</u>
Complaints received by Board	243	225	18		
Complaints heard by Board				852	55
<u>OF THOSE COMPLAINTS:</u>					
Complaints dismissed	91	65	0	77	7
Complaints referred to investigation	94	65	1	76	5
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of concern	16	15	0	16	1
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of remedial action	19	25	0	28	4
Complaints resolved with disciplinary letter of due diligence	13	7	0	13	0
Complaints resolved with probation	59	18	0	66	8

	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2009</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2009</u>
Complaints referred to informal hearing	79	15	0	55	0
Complaints referred to formal hearing	48	9	0	53	1
Complaints resolved with suspension	10	1	0	31	1
Complaints resolved with surrender	5	2	0	6	0
Complaints resolved with revocation	6	0	0	2	7
Complaints resolved with cease and desist letters	6	0	0	4	0

Violation Levels:

I	21	18	0	20	1
II	31	29	0	40	3
III	62	18	0	55	8
IV	8	1	0	5	0
V	11	0	0	27	3

Additional Information:

	<u>2006</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2009</u>
Jurisdiction Expired & Complaints Closed	20	12	11	4
Denials of New Applications	7	7	5	0
Denials of Renewal Applications	4	1	0	0

APPLICATION REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT

Debbie Rudd reported the following Arizona appraiser and property tax agent information as of February 17, 2009:

	<u>2/07</u>	<u>2/08</u>	<u>2/09</u>
Licensed Residential	1091	1032	840
Certified Residential	981	1170	1244
Certified General	768	800	828
Nonresident Temporary	41	30	40
Property Tax Agents	284	268	298
	<i>Total 2881</i>	<i>Total 3032</i>	<i>Total 2952</i>

Michael Marquess moved that the Board accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that, based on the expiration of Joseph R. Longoria's 90-day grace period to renew License #11588, the file be closed to be reopened and considered in the event Respondent reapplies; and that the Board rescind its referral to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE REPORT

Michael Marquess moved that the Board accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

OLD BUSINESS

Discussion and Action Concerning Solicitation from Momentum Appraisal Management Group for "Price Check—Market Analysis Request" Following Reply from Momentum Appraisal Management Group.

Staff was instructed to notify Momentum Appraisal Management Group to refer to FAQ 130 of the *Uniform Standards of Professional Practice* concerning "Price Check—Market Analysis Request". Staff was further instructed to post information concerning "comp checks" on the Board's website and to send the information to the Board's News & Alerts subscribers.

NEW BUSINESS

Discussion and Action Concerning Solicitation for Appraisal or Market Consultation Review from Brianna Nichols, Rels Valuation.

Staff was instructed to notify Rels Valuation that the services in the solicitation would require an appraiser to perform a Standard 3 Review.

Discussion and Action Concerning Approval of Reciprocal Agreement with the Rhode Island Real Estate Appraisers Board.

Debbie Rudd moved that the Board approve the reciprocal agreement with the Rhode Island Real Estate Appraisers Board. Victor Hartsfield seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Regarding Potential Revision to the 11/20/08 Supervising Appraiser/Trainee Frequently Asked Questions to be Consistent with the 1/15/09 Substantive Policy Statement #5, Guidelines for Evaluating Experience from a Licensed or a Certified Residential Appraiser Working toward a New Classification.

Debbie Rudd moved that the Board adopt the revisions to the 11/20/08 Supervising Appraiser/Trainee Frequently Asked Questions. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Concerning the Appraiser Investigator Training to be held 3/19-3/21, Sponsored by The Appraisal Foundation and the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials (AARO) in Phoenix, Arizona, Including Potential Reimbursement for Costs and Potential Approval as Continuing Education.

Debbie Rudd moved that the Board approve continuing education for the contract investigators attending the Appraiser Investigator Training in the amount of 50% of the actual time spent in training, or the amount of hours approved by The Appraisal Foundation. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. The Board noted that it could not provide reimbursement for mileage or meals for the training.

Discussion and Action Concerning Advertisement by Lending Arizona Mortgages.

The Board took no action.

Discussion and Action Concerning Value Inquiries (Comp Checks) Requested by Armor Appraisals Appraisal Management Company.

Staff was instructed to send Armor Appraisals Appraisal Management Company the requirements for comp checks under the *Uniform Standards of Professional Practice*, including FAQ 130.

Discussion and Action Regarding Election of Board Officers.

Cynthia Henry nominated Les Abrams as Chairperson of the Board and Debbie Rudd as Vice Chairperson of the Board. Victor Hartsfield seconded the nomination. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the nominations.

CONFIRMATION OF MEETING DATES, TIMES, LOCATIONS AND PURPOSES

The upcoming Committee and Board meetings were confirmed as follows:

February

27	Phoenix Board Outreach #1	9:00 a.m.
----	---------------------------	-----------

March

11	Application Review Committee	9:00 a.m.
11	Testing and Education Committee	9:30 a.m.
11	Board (Telephonic)	3:00 p.m.
27	Phoenix Board Outreach #2	9:00 a.m.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned.

/S/

Lester G. Abrams, Chairperson

**RECOMMENDATIONS
COMMITTEE ON APPLICATION REVIEW**

To: Board of Appraisal

From: Application Review Committee

Date: February 19, 2009

Re: February 18, 2009 Recommendations

I. Report on number of Arizona Appraisers and Property Tax Agents:

	<u>2/07</u>		<u>2/08</u>		<u>2/09</u>
Licensed Residential	1091		1032		840
Certified Residential	981		1170		1244
Certified General	768		800		828
Nonresident Temporary	41	Total 2881	30	Total 3032	40
Property Tax Agents	284		268		298
					Total 2952

II. As a result of its February 18, 2009 meeting the Application Review Committee makes the following recommendations:

- A.** To deny the following application based on A.R.S. §§ 32-3611(D)(4), 32-3620(A), 32-3631(A)(4):

7615 James L. Foust (by reciprocity)

- B.** To approve the following applications as substantively complete:

1. Licensed Residential by exam unless noted otherwise:

7610 Todd A. Steddom

7611 Jennifer M. Miller

2. Certified Residential by exam unless noted otherwise:

7536 Mary L. English

- C.** To approve the following applications as substantively complete and confirm the issuance of the following license/certification:

1. Reciprocity

12026 Shelly K. Hartley
22047 Shirley A. Wehking
22048 Ilona Allard
22049 Justin A. Druian
31699 Mitchell J. Perlow
31700 Donn H. Byrne, Jr.
31701 Raymond L. Dozier
31702 Gary G. Young

2. Nonresident Temporary

TP41120 Joseph S. Key
TP41121 James W. Myers
TP41122 James W. Myers

- D.** To disapprove the following applications as substantively incomplete and hold until substantively complete:

7618 Matthew T. Van Eck (by reciprocity)
7621 Glen Randall Bell (by reciprocity)

III. Applications Pending - Substantively Incomplete:

7376 Bagus Priambodo (by reciprocity)
7428 Carl Parker III
7555 Glen A. Gray, Jr.
7587 Keith T. Kavula (by reciprocity)

Notification of applicants with substantively incomplete applications who have not responded to the Committee's request for additional information. Pursuant to R4-46-202(D) applicants have up to a year to meet all requirements for license/certificate or applicant's file is to be closed by the Board and applicant shall reapply.

RECOMMENDATIONS

COMMITTEE ON APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION

TO: Board of Appraisal

FROM: Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education

DATE: February 19, 2009

RE: February 18, 2009 Recommendations

As a result of its February 18, 2009 meeting the Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education makes the following recommendations:

- I. To elect Gabe Corral as Committee chairperson
- II. Action regarding proposed approval of **qualifying education courses:**
 - A. Previously approved by the Board:
 - 1. Submitted by American Society of Farm Managers & Rural Appraisers
 - a. **A-101 Basic Appraisal Principles**, #ABA 0207-605-01 30 hours
Scott Seely
Recommend approval
 - 2. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
 - a. **Basic Appraisal Principles**, #ABA 0404-348-01 30 hours
Vickie Gill
Recommend approval
 - b. **Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use**, #ABA 0404-349-04
15 hours
Vickie Gill
Recommend approval
 - c. **Advanced Residential Applications & Case Studies-Part 1**, #ABA 0306-505-09
15 hours
Joseph Magdziarz
Recommend approval
 - d. **General Appraiser Report Writing and Case Studies**, #ABA 0407-620-15
30 hours
Richard Dubay, Maureen Mastroieni
Recommend approval

- e. **Advanced Residential Report Writing & Case Studies, Part 2, #ABA 0308-57-10** 30 hours
Joseph Magdziarz
Recommend approval
 - f. **Alternative Uses & Cost Valuation of Small, Mixed-Use Properties, #ABA 0308-758-10** 16 hours
Vincent Dowling
Recommend approval
 - g. **Income Valuation of Small, Mixed-Use Properties, #ABA 0308-759-10** 16 hours
Vincent Dowling
Recommend approval
 - h. **Sales Comparison Valuation of Small Mixed-Use Properties, #ABA 0308-760-10** 16 hours
Vincent Dowling
Recommend approval
3. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
- a. **AP-14A General Appraiser Income Approach, #ABA 0507-642-14** 30 hours
*Frank Bell, Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Earl Cass, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Richard Fasano, Jacques Fournier, Bill Gray, Matt Hassett, Kathleen Holmes, Robert Kaczmarek, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Jim Miller, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
4. Submitted by Best School of Real Estate & Appraisal
- a. **AP-03 2008-2009 National USPAP, #ABA 0502-214-03** 15 hours
*Daniel Smith, Roy Morris III
Recommend approval
5. Submitted by Career WebSchool
- a. **Basic Appraisal, #ABA D0406-523-01-02 Distance Education** 60 hours
A.M. (Bud) Black
Recommend approval
 - b. **Basic Appraisal Procedures, #ABA D0406-524-02 Distance Education** 30 hours
A.M. (Bud) Black
Recommend approval
 - c. **Basic Appraisal Principles, #ABA D0406-525-01 Distance Education** 30 hours
A.M. (Bud) Black
Recommend approval
 - d. **Residential Report Writing & Case Studies, #ABA D0406-526-07 Distance Education** 15 hours
A.M. (Bud) Black
Recommend approval
 - e. **Basic Appraisal & Reports, #ABA D0506-536-01-02-07 Distance Education** 75 hours
A.M. (Bud) Black
Recommend approval

- f. **Residential Sales Comparison & Income Approaches**, #ABA D0408-767-06
Distance Education, 30 hours
A.M. (Bud) Black
Recommend approval
- 6. Submitted by Dynasty School
 - a. **Residential Report Writing**, #ABA D0507-641-07 Distance Education 15 hours
*Robert Abelson
Recommend approval
 - b. **Advanced Residential Applications & Case Studies**, #ABA D0308-761-09
Distance Education 15 hours
Robert Abelson
Recommend approval
- 7. Submitted by McKissock Appraisal School
 - a. **Residential Sales & Income Approaches**, #ABA D0207-607-06 Distance Education 30 hours
Alan Simmons
Recommend approval
 - b. **Advanced Residential Applications & Case Studies**, #ABA D0208-735-09
Distance Education 15 Hours
*Alan Simmons
Recommend approval
 - c. **Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use**, #ABA D0208-736-04
Distance Education 15 Hours
*Daniel Bradley
Recommend approval

II. Action regarding proposed approval of **continuing education courses**:

A. **Previously approved by the Board:**

- 1. Submitted by American Society of Farm Managers & Rural Appraisers
 - a. **Spring Ag Outlook Forum** #ABA 1206-325 6 hours
*Charles Havranek, Dr. Jay Butler, Robert Wilson, Greg Vogel, Kate Maraces, Ben Cloud, Don Keuth
Recommend approval
- 2. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
 - a. **Online Professional's Guide to the Fannie Mae 2-4 Unit Form 1025**, #ABA D0407-625 Distance Education 10 hours
Arlene Mills
Recommend approval
 - b. **705 - Litigation Appraising: Specialized Topics & Applications**, #ABA 0202-144 15 hours
Stephen Roach, Roscove Shiplett
Recommend approval

- c. **General Demonstration Appraisal Report Writing Seminar**, #ABA 0402-202
7 hours
George Mann
Recommend approval
 - d. **700 the Appraiser As An Expert Witness: Preparation & Testing**, #ABA 0402-204 15 hours
Joseph Magdziarz
Recommend approval
 - e. **Condominiums, Co-Ops, and PUD's**, #ABA 0506-537 7 hours
Alan Simmons
Recommend approval
 - f. **Analytics with the Site to Do Business**, #ABA- 0307-614 7 hours
Leslie Sellers
Recommend approval
3. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
- a. **Home Valuation-Code of Conduct**, #ABA 0308-762 3 hours
*Gasper Crimando, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Michael Denious, Thomas Denny, Richard Fasano, Jacques Fournier, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Robert Kaczmarek, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, William Kozub, Mark Kramoltz, Don Miner, Roy Morris, David Rider, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
4. Submitted by Career WebSchool
- a. **Appraisal Methods**, #ABA D0705-461 Distance Education 14 hours
A.M. (Bud) Black
Recommend approval
 - b. **A URAR Form Review**, #ABA D0406-527 Distance Education 7 hours
Recommend approval
A.M. (Bud) Black
Recommend approval
5. Submitted by Hogan School of Real Estate
- a. **1031 Tax Deferred Exchanges in Today's Market**, #ABA 1001-045 3 hours
*Bradley Horton
Recommend approval
 - b. **Mold! & Other Furry Subjects**, #ABA 0203-268 3 hours
*Michael Kazz
Recommend approval
 - c. **Disclosure: The Practical Guide**, #ABA 0203-270 3 hours
*James Hogan
Recommend approval
 - d. **Planning & Zoning Made Simple**, #ABA 1206-600 3 hours
*Alex Kimmelman
Recommend approval
 - e. **Supervising Beginning Appraisers: Plan for Success**, #ABA 0308-763 4 hours
Sonny Solot, Thomas Baker, Steven Cole
Recommend approval

6. Submitted by McKissock Appraisal School
 - a. **Appraising Real Estate Owned (REO) and Foreclosure Properties**, #ABA 0406-530 7 hours
*Tracy Martin, Kenneth Guilfoyle
Recommend approval
 - b. **2008-2009 National USPAP Update**, #ABA 0506-539 7 hours
*Tracy Martin, Ken Guilfoyle
Recommend approval
 - c. **Even Odder: More Oddball Appraisals**, #ABA D0208-750 Distance Education
7 hours
*Daniel Bradley
Recommend approval
7. Submitted by Training Team Center
 - a. **The Relocation Appraisal – Understand the Process**, #ABA 1107-713 7 hours
Jay Delich
Recommend approval
 - b. **Unleash the Data; Know Your Market Tools**, #ABA 0208-752 3 hours
Jay Delich
Recommend approval
8. Submitted by Wachovia Appraisal Training
 - a. **2008-2009 National USPAP Update**, #ABA 0703-287 7 hours
*Mike Morton, Jr., Kevin Wardrop
Recommend approval
 - b. **Appraisal Review II**, #ABA 1103-312 8 hours
*Kevin Wardrop, Jennifer Swope, Rick Langdon, Todd Harris, Ron Choate
Recommend approval
 - c. **Construction to Permanent Appraisal Process**, #ABA 0208-756 15 hours
*Kevin Wardrop, Jennifer Swope, Rick Langdon, Todd Harris, Ron Choate
Recommend approval

B. Not previously approved by the Board:

1. Submitted by Acheson Appraisal Classes
 - a. **Appraiser Independence Regulations**, 3 hours
*Daniel Smith, Robert Fabrizio, Ross Acheson
Recommend approval
 - b. **FNMA 1004 MC**, 3 hours
Recommend approval
*Daniel Smith, Robert Fabrizio, Ross Acheson
Recommend approval
2. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
 - a. **Litigation Skills for the Appraiser: An Overview**, 7 hours
*Arlen Mills
Recommend approval

- b. **Using Spreadsheet Programs in Real Estate Appraisals- The Basics,** 7 hours
*Mark Ratterman
Recommend approval
- 3. Submitted by Appraisal Institute/ Phoenix Chapter
 - a. **The New Residential Market Conditions,** 3 hours
*Jay Delich
Recommend approval
- 4. Submitted by The Columbia Institute
 - a. **Fannie Mae Today, NO.116,** 8 hours
*Bernard Boarnet, Amelia Lovorn-Brown, Edmond Fisher, Kenneth Guilfoyle, George Harrison, Dr. Samuel Henderson, Diana Jacob, Martin Molloy, Roy Morris III, Bryan Renolds, Daniel Smith
Recommend approval
- 5. Submitted by Hogan School of Real Estate
 - a. **Annual Overview of the Tucson Real Estate Market,** 3 hours
*James Hogan
Recommend approval